

## Supported Bus Service 18: Renewal of Contract

---

### Transport, Infrastructure and Environment Committee

10 May 2011

#### Purpose of report

- 1 To inform the Committee of the results of the recent tendering process for the renewal of the Supported Bus Service Contract covering the off-peak and weekend operation of bus service 18.
- 2 To seek Committee approval for the award of contract.

#### Main report

- 3 Service 18 is the city's main southern orbital route, operating between the Royal Infirmary of Edinburgh (RIE) and the Gyle Centre. It provides a direct connection to the RIE and access to employment and retail opportunities to residents in the south of the city without the need for city centre interchange.
- 4 The service has long struggled to achieve commercial viability, and the Council has provided financial support for elements of this service for some years.
- 5 The Council currently subsidises the Monday to Friday off-peak journeys, as well as all weekend journeys, at a cost of £1,850 per week or £96,200 per annum. Over the past year, the average number of passengers was 4,597 per week, equating to a cost to the Council of approximately £0.40 per passenger.
- 6 The present contract was negotiated with Lothian Buses, and approved by the Transport, Infrastructure and Environment Committee at its meeting of 4 May 2010. The contract expires on 31 July 2011.
- 7 To ensure best value, as well as a measure of longer-term stability, it was decided to invite tenders for the off-peak and weekend elements of the service on a four year contract basis, with the option of extending the service by up to two more years, by mutual agreement.

- 8 A tendering process was initiated by an advertisement in the Official Journal of the European Union on Friday 21 January 2011.
- 9 The tender specified the provision of a service similar to that currently provided by Lothian Buses. A copy of the indicative timetable appears as Appendix 1 to this report.
- 10 Expressions of Interest were received from ten operators, of whom two submitted tenders by the closing date of Monday 7 March 2011.
- 11 The two tendering operators were Lothian Buses plc and First Scotland East. Lothian Buses tendered a weekly price of £1,940 per week, equivalent to £100,880 per annum. First Scotland East tendered a weekly price of £1,530, equivalent to £79,560 per annum.

#### **Tender evaluation**

- 12 All tenders were evaluated on the basis of cost and quality, and the scores achieved appear as Appendix 2 to this report.
- 13 First Scotland East achieved a weighted cost/quality score of 66.11, significantly higher than Lothian Buses' weighted score of 55.29.
- 14 It is therefore recommended that First Scotland East's tender is accepted.
- 15 It should be noted that this will result in two operators providing service 18, and that tickets issued by either operator will not be accepted on the other's vehicles. Holders of Concessionary Travel passes will, however be unaffected by this arrangement. The One-ticket multi-operator ticket will be valid on both operators' vehicles.
- 16 This type of situation has not arisen since the 1980s, when a number of services operated by Lothian Buses during the day, such as services 23 and 35/35, were operated by a different operator in the evenings and on Sundays under contracts let by the then Regional Council.
- 17 In more recent times, the western end of Lothian Buses service 24 (Davidson's Mains to Edinburgh Park Station) became, under a new contract, Horsburgh service 64, thus removing it from the Lothian Buses network, giving rise to similar ticketing and connectivity issues.
- 18 This kind of situation is more common elsewhere in the country than it has been in Edinburgh.

- 19 Transport Scotland is aiming to introduce Integrated Ticketing on a commercial basis, using the Smartcard-enabled ticket machines provided to all Local Bus Service operators by the Scottish Government. This project is at an early stage of development and will take some time yet to reach full operation.
- 20 As First Scotland East does not participate in the Bustracker real-time information scheme, journeys operated by the company on service 18 will not appear on Bustracker displays. The commercial journeys operated by Lothian Buses will, however, continue to be displayed.
- 21 First Scotland East, however, is participating in a SEStran project that would see real-time information introduced across the wider South- east Scotland area. This system is designed to integrate with the existing Bustracker system and will ultimately allow the possibility of information on the company's services being displayed on Bustracker units and website. Again, this project is at an early stage of development and will take some considerable time to reach full operation.

### **Financial implications**

- 22 First Scotland East has quoted a price of £1,530 per week to provide a service from the Gyle Centre to the Royal Infirmary of Edinburgh. This equates to £79,560 per annum and £53,331 up until the end of March 2012; and represents a decrease in cost of 17.3%.
- 23 The cost of the new contract for this service can be funded within the 2011/12 revenue budget for Supported Bus Services.

### **Equalities impact**

- 24 There is no adverse impact on equalities arising from this report; the provision of service promotes access to health, as well as to employment opportunities and other useful amenities.

### **Environmental impact**

- 25 The continuation of provision of a southern orbital bus service between the Royal Infirmary and the Gyle Centre will maintain the current mode ratios.

## Recommendations

- 26 To approve the award of a new contract to First Scotland East for this service, as described above at £1,530 per week, from Monday 1 August 2011 to Sunday 2 August 2015, with the option of extending for two further 12-month periods by mutual agreement.

**Dave Anderson**  
Director of City Development

---

Appendices	1	Service 18 indicative timetable as tendered
	2	Quality Scores and Combined Cost/Quality Scores
	3	First Scotland East's proposed timetable
Contact/tel/Email	Lynda Haughney – 0131 469 3633; <a href="mailto:Lynda.Haughney@edinburgh.gov.uk">Lynda.Haughney@edinburgh.gov.uk</a>	
Wards affected	All	
Single Outcome Agreement	Contributes to elements of <a href="#">National Outcome 14</a> : We reduce the local and global impact of our consumption and production.	
Background Papers	None	

## Appendix 1: Indicative Timetable

Service 18 – Monday to Friday - Eastbound										
Gyle Centre	0945	1045	1145	1245	1345	1445	1515	1540	1606	1636
South Gyle Access	0952	1052	1152	1252	1352	1452	1522	1548	1615	1645
Westside Plaza	1000	1100	1200	1300	1400	1500	1530	1557	1628	1658
Clovenstone	1004	1104	1204	1304	1404	1504	1534	1601	1632	1702
Oxgangs Bank	1017	1117	1217	1317	1417	1517	1548	1616	1647	1717
Kaimes Crossroads	1026	1126	1226	1326	1426	1526	1558	1628	1659	1729
Hyvot's Bank	1032	1132	1232	1332	1432	1532	1604	1634	1705	1735
Royal Infirmary	1041	1141	1241	1341	1441	1541	1614	1644	1715	1745

Service 18 – Monday to Friday - Westbound										
Royal Infirmary	1000	1045	1145	1250	1350	1450	1550	1623	1653	
Hyvot's Bank	1010	1055	1155	1300	1400	1500	1600	1635	1705	
Kaimes Crossroads	1016	1101	1201	1306	1406	1506	1608	1644	1713	
Oxgangs Bank	1025	1110	1210	1315	1415	1515	1617	1653	1722	
Clovenstone	1037	1122	1222	1327	1427	1527	1630	1706	1735	
Westside Plaza	1041	1126	1226	1331	1431	1531	1634	1710	1739	
South Gyle Access	1050	1135	1235	1340	1440	1540	1644	1720	1749	
Gyle Centre	1056	1141	1241	1346	1446	1546	1652	1728	1757	

Service 18 – Saturday - Eastbound									
Gyle Centre					0845	0945	1045	<i>then every hour until</i>	1745
South Gyle Access					0852	0952	1052		1752
Westside Plaza	0519	0619	0708	0808	0900	1000	1100		1800
Clovenstone	0522	0622	0711	0811	0903	1004	1104		1804
Oxgangs Bank	0533	0633	0723	0823	0915	1017	1117		1817
Kaimes Crossroads	0540	0640	0732	0832	0924	1026	1126		1826
Hyvot's Bank	0544	0644	0737	0837	0929	1032	1132		1832
Royal Infirmary	0551	0651	0745	0845	0937	1041	1141		1841

Service 18 – Saturday - Westbound									
Royal Infirmary	0709	0749	0849	0945	<i>then every hour until</i>	1645	1745	1845	2015
Hyvot's Bank	0716	0758	0858	0955		1655	1754	1854	2024
Kaimes Crossroads	0720	0803	0903	1001		1701	1759	1859	2029
Oxgangs Bank	0727	0811	0911	1010		1710	1807	1907	2036
Clovenstone	0739	0823	0923	1022		1722	1818	1918	2046
Westside Plaza	0743	0827	0927	1026		1726	1821	1921	2049
South Gyle Access	0750	0834	0934	1035		1735			
Gyle Centre	0756	0840	0940	1041		1741			

Service 18 – Sunday- Eastbound					
Gyle Centre		1145	<i>then every hour until</i>	1745	
South Gyle Access		1152		1752	
Westside Plaza	1100	1200		1800	1925
Clovenstone	1104	1204		1804	1929
Oxgangs Bank	1117	1217		1817	1942
Kaimes Crossroads	1126	1226		1826	1951
Hyvot's Bank	1132	1232		1832	1957
Royal Infirmary	1141	1241		1842	2006

Service 18 – Sunday - Westbound						
Royal Infirmary	1145	<i>then every hour until</i>	1645	1745	1845	2015
Hyvot's Bank	1155		1655	1754	1854	2024
Kaimes Crossroads	1201		1701	1759	1859	2029
Oxgangs Bank	1210		1710	1807	1907	2036
Clovenstone	1222		1722	1818	1918	2046
Westside Plaza	1226		17226	1821	1921	2049
South Gyle Access	1235		1735			
Gyle Centre	1241		1741			

## Appendix 2

FINAL TECHNICAL SCORES	
Tenderers	
First	76.17
Lothian Buses	95.17

PRICE SCORE CALCULATIONS		
The mean or average price of the acceptable tenders received is given 50 points 1 point is deducted from the score of each tenderer for each percentage point above the mean or average 1 point is added to the score of each tenderer for each percentage point below the mean or average		
<b>how to calculate Price Scores:</b>		
1. work out the actual difference between the actual price and the mean (average) price 2. divide the difference by the mean (average) price 3. multiply by 100		
PRICE SCORES	First	Lothian Buses
cost for 1 week	£1,530.00	£1,940.00
Price Score (mean is £1,735 )		
	50	50
Mean deviation percentage	-11.80%	11.80%
Price Score	61.8	38.2
OVERALL SCORES	First	Lothian Buses
Quality Weighting x Quality Score	30% x 76.17 = 22.85	30% x 95.17 = 28.55
Price Weighting x Price Score	70% x 61.8 = 43.26	70% x 38.2 = 26.74
Total Overall Score	66.11	55.29

### Appendix 3: First Scotland East's proposed timetable

First

Gyle Centre - Royal Infirmary

Monday to Friday

Service No	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18
Gyle Centre	0945	1045	1145	1245	1345	1445	1515	1545	1625	1655
South Gyle Access	0952	1052	1152	1252	1352	1452	1522	1553	1634	1704
Westside Plaza	1000	1100	1200	1300	1400	1500	1530	1602	1647	1717
Clovenstone	1004	1104	1204	1304	1404	1504	1534	1606	1651	1721
Oxgangs Bank	1017	1117	1217	1317	1417	1517	1548	1621	1706	1736
Kaimes Crossroads	1026	1126	1226	1326	1426	1526	1558	1633	1718	1748
Hyvol's Bank	1032	1132	1232	1332	1432	1532	1604	1639	1724	1754
Royal Infirmary (Little France)	1041	1141	1241	1341	1441	1541	1614	1649	1734	1804
Trip Mileages	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00

Service No	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18
Royal Infirmary (Little France)	0945	1045	1145	1245	1345	1445	1515	1545	1625	1655
Hyvol's Bank	0955	1055	1155	1255	1355	1455	1525	1557	1637	1707
Kaimes Crossroads	1001	1101	1201	1301	1401	1501	1533	1606	1645	1715
Oxgangs Bank	1010	1110	1210	1310	1410	1510	1542	1615	1654	1724
Clovenstone	1022	1122	1222	1322	1422	1522	1555	1628	1707	1737
Westside Plaza	1026	1126	1226	1326	1426	1526	1559	1632	1711	1741
South Gyle Access	1035	1135	1235	1335	1435	1535	1609	1642	1721	1751
Gyle Centre	1041	1141	1241	1341	1441	1541	1617	1650	1729	1759
Trip Mileages	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00



First

## Gyle Centre - Royal Infirmary

18

### Saturday

Service No	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18
Gyle Centre				0750	0850	0945	1045	1145	1245	1345	1445	1545	1645	1745	
South Gyle Access				0757	0857	0952	1052	1152	1252	1352	1452	1552	1652	1752	
Westside Plaza	0515	0625	0705	0805	0905	1000	1100	1200	1300	1400	1500	1600	1700	1800	1925
Clovenstone	0518	0628	0708	0808	0908	1004	1104	1204	1304	1404	1504	1604	1704	1804	1929
Oxgangs Bank	0529	0639	0720	0820	0920	1017	1117	1217	1317	1417	1517	1617	1717	1817	1942
Kaimes Crossroads	0536	0646	0729	0829	0929	1026	1126	1226	1326	1426	1526	1626	1726	1826	1951
Hyvol's Bank	0540	0650	0734	0834	0934	1032	1132	1232	1332	1432	1532	1632	1732	1832	1957
Royal Infirmary (Little France)	0547	0657	0742	0842	0942	1041	1141	1241	1341	1441	1541	1641	1741	1841	2006
Trip Mileages	9.20	9.20	9.20	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	9.20

Service No	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18
Royal Infirmary (Little France)	0550	0700	0750	0850	0945	1045	1145	1245	1345	1445	1545	1645	1745	1845	2015
Hyvol's Bank	0559	0707	0759	0859	0955	1055	1155	1255	1355	1455	1555	1655	1754	1854	2024
Kaimes Crossroads	0604	0711	0804	0904	1001	1101	1201	1301	1401	1501	1601	1701	1759	1859	2029
Oxgangs Bank	0611	0718	0812	0912	1010	1110	1210	1310	1410	1510	1610	1710	1807	1907	2036
Clovenstone	0621	0730	0824	0924	1022	1122	1222	1322	1422	1522	1622	1722	1818	1918	2046
Westside Plaza	0624	0734	0828	0928	1026	1126	1226	1326	1426	1526	1626	1726	1821	1921	2049
South Gyle Access		0741	0835	0935	1035	1135	1235	1335	1435	1535	1635	1735			
Gyle Centre		0747	0841	0941	1041	1141	1241	1341	1441	1541	1641	1741			
Trip Mileages	9.20	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	9.20	9.20	9.20

First

## Gyle Centre - Royal Infirmary

---

Sundays	Ref.No.: RAD								
Service No	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18
Gyle Centre		1145	1245	1345	1445	1545	1645	1745	
South Gyle Access		1152	1252	1352	1452	1552	1652	1752	
Westside Plaza	1100	1200	1300	1400	1500	1600	1700	1800	1925
Clovenstone	1104	1204	1304	1404	1504	1604	1704	1804	1929
Oxgangs Bank	1117	1217	1317	1417	1517	1617	1717	1817	1942
Kaimes Crossroads	1126	1226	1326	1426	1526	1626	1726	1826	1951
Hyvot's Bank	1132	1232	1332	1432	1532	1632	1732	1832	1957
Royal Infirmary (Little France)	1141	1241	1341	1441	1541	1641	1741	1841	2006
Trip Mileages	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00

---

Service No	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18
Royal Infirmary (Little France)	1145	1245	1345	1445	1545	1645	1745	1845	2015
Hyvot's Bank	1155	1255	1355	1455	1555	1655	1754	1854	2024
Kaimes Crossroads	1201	1301	1401	1501	1601	1701	1759	1859	2029
Oxgangs Bank	1210	1310	1410	1510	1610	1710	1807	1907	2036
Clovenstone	1222	1322	1422	1522	1622	1722	1818	1918	2046
Westside Plaza	1226	1326	1426	1526	1626	1726	1821	1921	2049
South Gyle Access	1235	1335	1435	1535	1635	1735			
Gyle Centre	1241	1341	1441	1541	1641	1741			
Trip Mileages	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00