

## THE FIFE COUNCIL

Minute of Meeting of Mossmorran and Braefoot Bay Community Safety Committee - New City House, Dunfermline.

14th March, 2013

6.30 p.m. - 9.00 p.m.

### **PRESENT:-**

<u>Name</u>	<u>Designation/Representing</u>
Councillor Peter Lockhart	Chair, Fife Council
Councillor Gavin Yates	Fife Council
Councillor Susan Leslie	Fife Council
William Dryburgh	Aberdour Community Council
Alex MacDonald	Burntisland Community Council
David Taylor	Cardenden & Kinglassie Community Council
Alex Haddow	Cowdenbeath Community Council
Colin McPhail	Dalgety Bay and Hillend Community Council
Ernest McPherson	Lochgelly Community Council
Amelia Howie	Lumphinnans Community Council
Ron McKenzie	Auchtertool Community Council
Robert Arnott	Crossgates and Mossgreen Community Council
Sarah Mieзитis	SEPA (Scottish Environment Protection Agency)
John Lamb	SEPA (Scottish Environment Protection Agency)
Liz Box	Fife Council (Corporate Services)

### **ALSO PRESENT:-**

Tim Steadman	Plant Manager, ExxonMobil Chemical Limited
Ian Hackers	ExxonMobil Chemical Limited
David Burgess	Plant Manager, Shell U.K. Limited
John Raine	Shell U.K. Limited
Steven Cline	CEO, Kennedy Renewables

### **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE:-**

Mary Stewart	Fife Council (Enterprise, Planning & Protective Services)
--------------	---

#### **1.0 WELCOME AND INTRODUCTION**

Councillor Peter Lockhart, Chair, welcomed Mr. Ron McKenzie who had replaced Councillor Harry Rodger as the Auchtertool Community Council representative on the Committee. He also welcomed Mr. Steven Cline and Mr. Johnny Kennedy, Kennedy Renewables.

#### **2.0 WIND FARM DEVELOPMENTS IN MOSSMORRAN AND BRAEFoot BAY AREA**

Mr Steven Cline, Kennedy Renewables gave a presentation on wind farm developments by Kennedy Renewables in the Mossmorran and Braefoot Bay area. He introduced Mr. Johnny Kennedy, son of the owner, Mr. Brian Kennedy. Mr Cline advised on previous developments by Kennedy Renewables in the renewable resource sector, including solar, wind and biomass energy developments. He advised that Kennedy Renewables had acquired the wind farm site at Raith at the end/

end of 2010 and that financial close for development of the site had taken place in 2011. The wind farm had been constructed on budget and had an expected lifespan of 25 years. He referred to issues raised in the planning condition and by the local communities in respect of monitoring of benzene levels on site, both before, and after construction. He indicated that this was currently taking place at two locations in Cowdenbeath and Lochgelly and at a location at Little Raith for a period of 18 months. Data from the first six months of monitoring would be reported to the local community, following full analysis. A further monitoring report would be prepared following a further six month monitoring period

Thereafter, Mr Cline advised that Kennedy Renewables had commissioned a study on the likely impact of the effect of wind turbines close to industrial emissions, i.e. benzene and hydrocarbons. The study, by Fichner, identified the potential for a slight increase in turbulence for 150 metres past the turbines. At this point there was likely to be a drop in turbulence. This would have the effect of causing any possible emissions which might be carried in the air to drop at this 150 metre point past the turbine. Applying this scenario to the Wind Farm at Little Raith, it was likely that there would be a drop in any emissions from Mossmorran reaching Lochgelly and Cowdenbeath areas, past the wind turbines. The results of the full study arising from the data collected would be available in May.

In response to questions, Steven Cline advised that monitoring was carried out every two weeks, with data from the samples analysed and a mean measurement taken over the two week period. Ian Hackers advised that data on air quality emissions from the plant at Mossmorran and Braefoot Bay was collected and analysed throughout the year and that this was monitored by the Mossmorran and Braefoot Bay Independent Air Quality Monitoring Review Group

In further discussion, the Committee were advised that the Air Quality Monitoring Group had established that to date, all emissions were within permitted levels and Steven Cline again stressed that it was unlikely that there would be any significant impact on the communities of Lochgelly and Cowdenbeath.

Thereafter, members sought an analysis of data during periods when flaring took place at Mossmorran. In this regard, ExxonMobil and Shell UK were asked to provide information on those periods when flaring occurred.

### **Decision**

The Group:-

- (1) noted that there was a desire for further monitoring, beyond initial monitoring being carried out, to reassure communities in the Mossmorran and Braefoot Bay area, including Lochgelly and Cowdenbeath;
- (2) noted that Kennedy Renewables intended to continue to monitor benzene levels for a period of 18 months, following which time a full report would be prepared and that an interim monitoring report would be prepared after a six months;
- (3)/

- (3) noted that depending on the outcome of the interim and full reports, Kennedy Renewables might consider further monitoring, if necessary. However, they did not intend to continue monitoring should analysis show that emission levels were not significant and within permitted levels; and
- (4) that ExxonMobil and Shell should provide information on the dates and times of flaring to the independent Air Quality Monitoring Group, which could be used with the monitoring data produced by Kennedy Renewables.

### 3.0 MINUTE

#### 3.1 **Minute of meeting of the Mossmorran and Braefoot Bay Community Safety Committee of 13th December, 2012**

##### **Decision**

The Committee approved the minute, having noted that Colin McPhail, Community Councillor, Dalgety Bay & Hillend Community Council was in attendance.

##### **Matter Arising**

With reference to paragraph 6.2, Mr. Ron McKenzie indicated that he had requested a copy the incident report on the gas leak incident on Wednesday, 5th December and that he had received a copy of the report from SEPA. Sarah Mieztis indicated that the report was available on the SEPA public register. The incident report detailed the causes of the incident and actions identified to prevent it from happening again. Ian Hackers advised that ExxonMobil had submitted the report to SEPA, but that it had not been available for the previous meeting of this Committee. Recommendations in the report and additional recommendations from SEPA were being followed up by ExxonMobil. Progress was being tracked by SEPA Inspectors.

##### **Decision**

The Group agreed:-

- (1) to note the action on the gas leak incident on 5<sup>th</sup> December, 2013 and that the report from SEPA be made available to members of the Committee; and
- (2) that the Committee should receive information relating to issues which might have long term implications for the Plant, as early as possible.

#### 3.2 **Minute of Meeting of Mossmorran and Braefoot Bay Air Quality Review Group of 21st January, 2013**

##### **Decision**

The Minute was noted.

##### **Matters Arising**

Colin McPhail advised that Fife Council monitored air quality at a number of sites across/ across Fife and that monitoring data from the sites around Mossmorran and Braefoot Bay was reported to the Independent Air Quality Monitoring Review Group. The

Group produced an annual report which included the data from Fife Council, together with data from the ExxonMobil, Shell and BP sites.

Councillor Gavin Yates advised that the Cowdenbeath Area Committee had recommended that Councillor Lockhart, Councillor Susan Leslie and Councillor Yates be appointed as observers on the Mossmorran and Braefoot Bay Independent Air Quality Monitoring Review Group.

#### 4.0 **COMMUNITY ISSUE - PERMANENT MONITORING**

The Chair, Councillor Peter Lockhart advised that Cowdenbeath Area Committee had recommended permanent monitoring of benzene in the Cowdenbeath and Lochgelly areas, in light of the wind farm development and its position near to the Mossmorran Plant. The Area Committee sought information on peaks in benzene levels. He also indicated that the recent flaring had alarmed the local communities and sought reassurances on the safety of the Plants and health of communities in these areas.

Ian Hackers advised that, in 2000 and 2001, the Independent Air Quality Monitoring Review Group had commissioned an air quality survey to monitor a range of hydrocarbons at 15 locations around the Mossmorran and Braefoot sites over an 18 month period, at a cost of around £150,000.

Ian Hackers advised that a second period of monitoring was carried out in 2008 between August and October, at 8 locations, including three residential areas. The second monitoring cost around £35,000 and included a period of shut down and start-up, when flaring was being carried out. Both sets of monitoring were carried out by the National Physical Laboratory (NPL), one of the leading consultants in this type of environmental air quality monitoring. The results of both surveys found there to be no significant impact on local air quality. Ian Hackers and David Burgess suggested that no additional monitoring be considered by the Plants until monitoring data from Kennedy Renewables had been analysed and reviewed by the Independent Air Quality Monitoring Group.

John Lamb, SEPA provided information on how the results of the air quality monitoring assessment being carried out by Kennedy Renewables compared to exposure data published by the Health Protection Agency. He also explained that the measured concentrations at all three locations were very low and were typical of rural concentrations. Personal exposure whilst driving or filling a car with petrol was far greater. Sarah Mieztis explained that SEPA were considering a position statement on Mossmorran which would incorporate this message.

#### **Decision**

The Committee agreed:-

- (1) to note that the results of a recent a health study in the Cowdenbeath and Lochgelly areas would be made available to communities in early course;
- (2)/  
(2) to note that an interim report from Kennedy Renewables would be submitted to the next meeting of this Group in June 2013, together with information from ExxonMobil and Shell on flaring during the period of monitoring;
- (3) that further consideration would be given by this Committee to further monitoring following receipt of the interim report from Kennedy Renewables in June and receipt of the full report in September; and
- (4) to note that SEPA would pursue the possibility of providing a web page on the Plants at Mossmorran and Braefoot Bay.

5.0 **COMMUNICATION WITH COMMUNITY COUNCILS/COMMUNITIES**  
(Previous Minute Reference Para. 5.1(2) of Minute of Meeting of 13th Dec, 2012)

- 5.1 Liz Box reported that she had consulted with representatives from ExxonMobil and Shell with regard to the format for reporting to the Committee in future and had held discussions on the best way to make minutes of meetings and reports from ExxonMobil, Shell U.K. and SEPA available in public.

**Decision**

The Group agreed:-

- (1) that in future, following meetings of the Committee, Community Councils should make available on their websites minutes of meetings, together with reports from ExxonMobil, Shell U.K. and SEPA; and
- (2) to note that as far as possible, reports from ExxonMobil and SEPA would be made available in advance of meetings and that the report from Shell would be made available at the meeting.

6.0 **COMMUNICATION WITH COMMUNITY COUNCILS/COMMUNITIES - UPDATES**

- 6.1 The Committee noted comments from Community Councillors as follows:-

**Dalgety Bay & Hillend**

Colin McPhail expressed appreciation to ExxonMobil for the Burns Supper and asked that Shell U.K. give further consideration to taking action to address the overgrown paths and verges along Beach Avenue. He indicated that he had arranged to meet with representatives from Shell UK with a view to identifying an area of land for the local Woodland for Hope project for people in the area with cancer. Thereafter Colin McPhail drew attention to the publication of the Local Fife Plan which contained Wind Farm developments around the Mossmorran Area.

**Auchtertool Community Council**

Ron McKenzie expressed appreciation to Shell UK Ltd and ExxonMobil for their generosity in providing support in the community.

**Burntisland/  
Burntisland Community Council**

Alex MacDonald expressed appreciation for the Burns Supper, Scotland-v-Rugby match hospitality and the Senior Citizen's Burns Lunch. He also expressed concerns from the Community Council and local community on the recent flaring.

**Cowdenbeath Community Council**

Alex Haddow expressed his appreciation to ExxonMobil and Shell UK Ltd on behalf of the local community for the Senior Citizen's Burns Supper and Pantomime. He also indicated that the flaring had been highly visible and noisy and that concerns had been expressed within the local community.

**Lumphinnans Community Council**

Amelia Howie expressed appreciation to ExxonMobil and Shell UK for their support, in particular for the Burns Supper and the Pantomime.

**Aberdour Community Council**

William Dryburgh expressed appreciation to ExxonMobil and Shell UK on behalf of the local community, in particular for the Pantomime and for the Burns Supper.

### **Lochgelly Community Council**

Ernest McPherson expressed appreciation on behalf of the local community for financial support to projects in the Lochgelly Area.

### **Crossgates & Mossmorran Community Council**

Robert Arnott expressed appreciation to ExxonMobil and Shell UK on behalf of the local community.

Thereafter, Councillor Peter Lockhart expressed his appreciation to ExxonMobil and to Shell UK for their contributions, on behalf of the Fife Councillors in the local area.

## **7.0 CURRENT SITUATION REPORTS**

### **7.1 SHELL U.K. LIMITED**

John Raine advised that there had been no reportable injuries in the year to date. The ground flare vapour recovery unit at Braefoot Bay had been returned to service. However, there had been a minor Pollution and Prevent Control (PPC) breach in January due to smoke emissions from the ground flare. There had been no direct community complaints during the period.

An emergency planning exercise was due to be carried out and a planned COMAH exercise would be held on 23rd October at Braefoot Bay. There was also a planned programme of site visits at Mossmorran with Fife Fire & Rescue and the annual pollution response exercise to test the pollution response plan would take place at Braefoot Bay on Wednesday, 2nd October.

A planned/

A planned inspection from HSE had been carried out with a focus on asbestos and electrical equipment plus human factors. An assessment of "good" had been awarded to Shell UK by SEPA for performance in 2012.

Shell U.K. Limited had, together with ExxonMobil, hosted a site visit for Benarty Community Council. A number of events also had been held including, career talks at Lochgelly High School, participation in Dundee Science Festival, Fife Science Week and St. Colme Family Science and Fun Day. In addition, a Youth Theatre project and Fine Art Exhibition had been held at Lochgelly Theatre. Donations had been given to Adam Smith and Carnegie Colleges. Donations totalling £5,800 had also been made to local community groups since the last report to this Committee. This included £2,000 to Crossgates Primary School for iPads.

In discussion, Councillor Peter Lockhart and Councillor Susan Leslie welcomed the work which was being carried out by Shell UK in relation to Education.

### **7.2 EXXONMOBIL CHEMICAL LIMITED**

Ian Hackers submitted a report for the period 12th December, 2012 - 14th March, 2013.

Ian Hackers apologised for any disruption or concerns to the communities due to flaring at the plant. He advised that there had been 6,411 days without a time losing injury to any person working on the site, 187 days since the last recordable injury and 1,269 days without an environmental incident resulting from a permit breach of consent.

Ian Hackers advised that the Burns Supper had taken place at Balbirnie House Hotel and that hospitality had been provided at the Royal Bank of Scotland Six Nations matches in the first quarter of 2013.

In relation to plant operations, there had been a process upset in the feed treatment unit on site on 7th February, 2013 which had resulted in elevated flaring for three days. ExxonMobil were working with the company who had provided the technology for the feed treatment unit in order to resolve the issue which had arisen from foaming of the new solvent used in the process. Damage to the pipe/vibration during this foaming process had led to a leak of solvent from the pipework onto the ground within the walls and concrete roadway. An incident report had been submitted to SEPA.

Three unattributed community complaints and 22 attributed complaints had been submitted to the Plant and these had been investigated and responded to where possible. Most had been relating to noise and elevated flaring. A complaint had been received regarding spotting on a driveway at Crossgates/Hill of Beath. However, this had been due to an accumulation of algae. A gas smell had been reported in the village of Aberdour. This had been traced as emanating from the river Forth, not the plant.

The construction of the Braefoot Bay Expansion Project had been successfully completed and ExxonMobil were now ready to commission a new compressor. This would involve running all three compressors in series for a period of 24 to 48 hours, during/ during which noise monitoring would be carried out. Local representatives would be informed prior to the compressor running. Thereafter, Ian Hackers advised on donations to the list of recipients appended to the report and advised that donations to the value of £9,460 had been made from the Site Safety Incentive Scheme during the reporting period.

A donation of £5,000 had also been made to Guide Dogs for the Blind, to name and sponsor a puppy through its first year of training. ExxonMobil had also donated the £8,000 to the Victoria Hospital, Kirkcaldy to enable them to purchase paediatric sleep apnoea testing equipment. The sum of £10,000 had also been donated to Kirkcaldy YMCA to support a community project to enable young people to take on volunteering roles within the YMCA framework.

He indicated that the Fife Ethylene Plant was recruiting for 10 new Process Technicians. There had been an overwhelming response for these posts. Advertisements had also been placed in local papers for young people to join the site apprenticeship scheme and the successful candidates would join the programme in September, 2013. ExxonMobil had also jointly hosted a meeting with representatives from local communities on 6th February, at the request of Benarty Community Council.

In response to a question from Ernest McPherson on noise, following the installation of the new flare tip, Ian Hackers advised that it was too early to gauge any improvement from the previous flare tip as yet.

### 7.3 **SEPA**

Sarah Meizitis presented a report from SEPA for 13th September, 2012 to December, 2012 as follows:-

#### 7.3.1 **ExxonMobil Fife Ethylene Plant (FEP)**

Sarah Meizitis advised that there had been a feed treatment unit incident on 7th February, 2013 leading to elevated flaring at the Fife Ethylene Plant. During the incident, there was a loss of containment of the feed treatment unit

solvent. Several complaints had been received from the local community. Complaints received by SEPA related to flaring, noise and visual impact.

SEPA had followed up an incident regarding a pinhole gas leak on 5th December, 2012 at the Fife Ethylene Plant. Checks had been carried out and the plant had been inspected. Changes proposed by the Fife Ethylene Plant were satisfactory but SEPA had felt that opportunities had been missed to prevent the incident. Follow-up actions would be monitored during routine inspections in 2013.

An intensive site audit had been planned for the second half of 2013 in response to incidents over the past 6 months. The Safety Review Report had been concluded for the Fife Ethylene Plant and had been found to be satisfactory. The SEPA compliance assessment for 2012 for the Fife Ethylene Plant was rated "Good" and the compliance assessment for the Braefoot Bay site was rated excellent.

Sarah/

Sarah intended to inspect the site to follow-up on the 7<sup>th</sup> February 2013 incident in relation to solvents going into the drain and leaks from the pipework. The results of this visit would be fed back to HSE. She would also look into flaring which was required to be minimised in order to reduce visual and noise impact on communities. If necessary the permit would be varied.

### **7.3.2 Shell U.K. Limited**

Sarah advised that the 2012 compliance assessment scheme had been signed off for Shell. The smoke flaring incident (29 minutes) had been investigated, on grounds that it be recorded as a minor breach of the SEPA Compliance Assessment Scheme. SEPA had also made comments on the review of the Best Available Techniques (BAT) in relation to the operation of the Shell U.K. ground flares.

The Safety Report for the Shell UK Plant at Braefoot Bay had been accepted by SEPA and included the method for assessing a major incident to the environment. The SEPA compliance assessment for 2012 for the Shell Fife FNGL plant was rated "Good".

Thereafter Sarah set out other activities which she had carried out, including attendance at the Independent Air Quality Monitoring Review Group meeting on 21st January, 2013, attendance at Cowdenbeath Area Committee on 7th March, 2013, looking into possibility of dedicated web pages on the SEPA website with other measures to improve communications with communities, and a joint meeting to discuss the management of BAT with Shell U.K. and ExxonMobil Chemicals Limited for 12th April, 2013.

### **Decision**

The Committee noted the updates and that the SEPA compliance assessments for the plants had been downgraded to "good" following the flaring incidents.

## **8.0 OTHER COMPETENT BUSINESS**

Ron McKenzie sought further information on safety procedures from the HSE and safety procedures at the site. In response, Ian Hackers invited representatives from Auchtertool Community Council to visit the site.

## **9.0 DATES OF FUTURE MEETINGS**

Members agreed to note the following dates of future meetings:-



Thursday, 13th June, 2013 - 6.30 p.m.  
Thursday, 12th September, 2013 - 6.30 p.m.  
Thursday, 12th December, 2013 - 6.30 p.m.

Members also agreed that, if possible meetings would be held at the City Chambers,  
Dunfermline.

---